REVIEW INSTRUCTIONS AND SCORING SHEETS
2015 THIRD YEAR THEME PAPER (TYTP)

OVERVIEW

TYTP: A publishable-quality conceptual paper that reviews the literature in the student's chosen sub-field, and, in doing so, puts forth and defends a thesis.

I. RATING: Please rate the paper, based on the following.

A score of pass indicates that the paper, with minor revisions, would be a credible candidate for publication in a respected education research journal. A paper should receive a pass if you have few suggestions for substantial revision, or, on the second review of a paper earlier assigned a no pass or fail, you believe the student has for the most part successfully responded to your previous suggestions.

A Score of no pass on the first round indicates that the paper is not yet a credible candidate for publication in a respected educational research journal.

A score of fail on the second or third round indicates that the paper is not yet a credible candidate for publication in a respected educational research journal. While the paper may be somewhat improved, it still is not deemed to be a pass, and it will be scored a fail. Note that students who fail the second round are placed on academic probation. Students who fail the third round are recommended for disqualification.

II. COMMENTS TO THE STUDENT

Please write comments that will be read by the student. We suggest that you make these as lengthy and as detailed, and similar in tone and content, as you would for a manuscript that you review for a quality academic journal. Please comment on both the positive aspects of the paper as well as how it may be improved. Do not mention in your comments the specific rating that you have assigned to the paper.

III. PRIVATE COMMENTS TO THE STEERING COMMITTEE

You may optionally add private comments to the steering committee. This is not required or expected.

1 For one excellent set of guidelines for reviewing a manuscript for an academic journal, see http://www.reading.org/General/Publications/for_reviewers_index/reviewing_for_rrq.aspx
RATING FORM: THIRD YEAR THEME PAPER

Please complete and submit by email to lfellus@uci.edu within 10 days of receipt of manuscript.

Reader: XXXXX

Title of Submission: XXXX

I. First Submission RATING: How do you rate this paper on the following scale? Mark the one that applies:

☐ PASS

☐ NO PASS

II. Second and Third Submission RATING: How do you rate this paper on the following scale? Mark the one that applies:

☐ PASS

☐ FAIL
II. COMMENTS TO THE STUDENT
III. COMMENTS TO THE STEERING COMMITTEE